

## Maryland State Commission on Environmental Justice and Sustainable Communities

# **Annual Report**

October 2016-November 2017

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
1.	Background	3
2.	Commissioners Serving	4
3.	Commission Activities October 2016 – November 2017	5
4.	Commission Activities	6
5.	Appendix A – 2016-2017 Meeting Minutes	12

## 1. Background

## **CEJSC Background**

The Commission on Environmental Justice and Sustainable Communities (CEJSC) was first established by Executive Order on January 1, 2001 and signed into law on May 22, 2003. The Commission is a fifteen-member body that includes the following representatives: two State legislators, three cabinet secretaries, and ten Governor appointees representing six interest groups: environmental advocacy, public health, local government, regulated business, impacted community, and the general public with expertise and/or interest in environmental justice.

The CEJSC is tasked with examining environmental justice and sustainable community issues that may be associated with creating healthy, safe, economically vibrant, environmentally sound communities for all Marylanders in a manner that allows for democratic processes and community involvement. Maryland's approach to Environmental Justice (EJ) is consistent with the approach advocated by the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). EPA calls for States to address Environmental Justice issues as appropriate and for improvements in efficiency and sustainability in the use of resources and production processes. EPA defines EJ as,

"The fair treatment and meaningful involvement of all people regardless of race, color, national origin, or income with respect to the development, implementation, and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations, and policies." Fair treatment means that no group of people including a racial, ethnic, or socio-economic group should bear a disproportionate share of the negative environmental consequences resulting from industrial, municipal, and commercial operations or the execution of federal, state, local, and tribal programs and policies.

Additionally, Maryland's definition, which builds on EPA's definition, specifically notes that all citizens of the State should expect (1) to be protected from public health hazards and (2) to have access to the socio-economic resources necessary to address concerns about their livelihood and health.

## 2. Commissioners Serving

Vacancy, Commission Chair

Senator Victor Ramirez, State Senate (\*State Legislature)

Delegate Clarence Lam House of Delegates (\*State Legislature)

Secretary Ben Grumbles, Maryland Department of the Environment (\*State Agency)

Secretary Van Mitchell, Department of Health and Mental Hygiene (\*State Agency)

Secretary David Craig, Maryland Department of Planning (\*State Agency)

Secretary Pete Rahn, Maryland Department of Transportation (\*State Agency)

Mr. Richard Fairbanks (\*Impacted Community)

Mr. Stephan Levitsky (\*Impacted Community)

Mr. Andrew Fellows, Commission Vice Chair, Mayor of College Park (\*Environmental Organization)

Vacancy (\* Local Government)

Mr. Benoy Thomas, Licensed Social Worker (\*Public Interest)

Ms. Vernice Miller-Travis, Commission Vice Chair, Miller-Travis & Associates, environmental (\*Public Interest)

Mr. John Quinn, Constellation Energy (\*Regulated Business)

Vacancy (\*Environmental Organization)

Rev. Meredith Moise, Groundswell Energy (\*Public Interest)

Rebecca Rehr, Maryland Environmental Health Network (\*Health Expert)

#### 3. Commission Activities

Of the twelve members appointed by the Governor to the Commission, one member must be a representative of a business organization, a representative of an environmental organization, a health expert, a local government representative, and a person of the general public with interest or expertise in environmental justice. At least two of the Governor's Appointees should be representatives of an affected community.

There is an effort to balance the representation and generally there is an average of two members for each category. For example, a local government person may have a business background; an advocate may specialize in public health issues.

Vacancies frequently occur in the Commission when members make the decision to either step down from their position or to leave the Commission entirely. Currently there are several vacancies, and many remaining members are subject to reappointment.

The documents included in this report include a letter submitted to the Maryland Climate Change Commission and a list of meeting minutes between October 2016-November 2017.

## Plan Commission Objectives for 2017-2018

The Commission will continue to evaluate issues pertaining to public health, including by looking at case studies in areas most affected by pollution. The Commission will consider looking into providing internship opportunities to conduct case studies.



STATE OF MARYLAND Commission on Environmental Justice & Sustainable Communities

Maryland Commission on Climate Change

November 9, 2016

Dear Commissioners,

Thank you for the invitation to make recommendations as you consider equity in pursuing the goals of the Greenhouse Gas Reduction Act (GGRA). We value inclusion in your charge to "address any disproportionate impacts of climate change on low-income and vulnerable communities" as it aligns with our work. We look forward to collaborating with you as we work towards achieving equity through climate policy. After several discussions with the Mitigation Working Group and responses to an initial list of recommendations we sent in April, we understand you are specifically asking for areas of the state where you can focus enhanced outreach with support from the Education, Communications, and Outreach Working Group.

At our annual retreat in July, we agreed on two areas of the state where the MCCC could focus outreach: Brandywine in southern Prince George's County and the Eastern Shore, exact location TBD. Each area is facing an overburden of pollution, and is especially vulnerable to adverse and disruptive climate change impacts. We recommend that the fall be spent identifying the precise target areas and community-based leaders who can help the MCCC prioritize issues and resources that will be most useful to the community, and then 2017 be spent hosting the meetings. We would be happy to partner with you as you undertake these outreach and public engagement efforts.

We look forward to continuing to serve in an advisory capacity as you implement these recommendations.

Sincerely,

Vernice Miller-Travis

Vernice Miller-Travis, Vice Chair Skeo Solutions

Delegate Clarence Lam House of Delegates

Senator Victor Ramirez

Secretary Kenneth Holt, MD Department of Housing and Community Development

Secretary David R. Craig MD Department of Planning

Secretary Peter K. Rahn MD Department of Transportation

Secretary Michael Gill MD Department Commerce

Secretary Van T. Mitchell, MD Department of Health and Mental Hygiene

Secretary Ben Grumbles, Maryland Department of the Environment

Richard Fairbanks Baltimore City Resident

Stephan Levitsky, Eastern Shore Resident

John Quinn, BG

Dr. Lesliam Quiros Alcala, UMD School of Public Health

Rebecca Rehr, MD Environmental Health Network

Benoy Thomas, Government

## 5. Appendix A - 2015-2016 Meeting Minutes

Maryland Commission on Environmental Justice & Sustainable Communities (CEJSC) Montgomery Park, Baltimore, MD Conference Call Minutes October 24, 2016

## In Attendance by Phone

- Commissioners: Vernice Miller-Travis, Rebecca Rehr, Delegate Clarence Lam, Duane Johnson, Janet Moye Cornick
- Participants: Dawn Nixon, Laura Rogers, Andrew Fellows, David

## O'Leary, Okosu Dosu Minutes Approval

June meeting minutes were approved.

## Commission Vacancies Update

Duane Johnson indicated that he talked to Jeff Fretwell, Director of Legislative & Intergovernmental Relations, who suggested that the Commission wait untill he confirms the 3 candidates who have already been submitted to the Governor's Office of Appointments. He will then begin for work on the other 3 vacancies on the Commission.

Vernice suggested meeting with Secretary Grumbles to discuss the remaining vacancies before a decision is made.

## **CEJSC Annual Report**

Duane shared what action items needed to be completed for the report. Vernice, Rebecca and

Andy will be taking leads on getting the report completed.

Rebecca said we need to request the need for a Chair of the Commission and the need to do better education on environmental justice work. This should to be included in the report.

Vernice asked Delegate Clarence Lam to provide a paragraph on the development of the Reduce Act and what went into it. This should be included in the report.

Vernice asked to have Angelo Bianco, ARMA Deputy Director provide a synopsis of the status of the Cumulative Impact Working Group.

## Local Government Update

## Maryland Municipal League (MML)

Andy Fellows said he will be working on the draft article for Maryland Municipal League in the next coming week.

Duane will be checking with Les Knapp of MACo about CEJSC attending their December

#### conference. Case Studies Update

#### **BRANDYWINE COMMUNITY:**

Vernice said she's been in touch with the folks at Brandywine and indicated that the community does not want an Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) in regards to the complaint they filed with the EPA.

Vernice has asked the Brandywine folks if they could come to a CEJSC meeting with an update on their complaint to the EPA. She also wants to make sure that the Brandywine issues are being addressed and not side tracked.

Vernice said Brandywine community is interested in serving as a case study but wants to know what that means and what will be the outcomes of the study.

Vernice said besides Maryland Department of Transportation she can't think of any other state agency that has a Title IV policy in place. Duane indicated that MDE is looking into a Title IV policy.

Vernice suggested convening a discussion with stakeholders including state agencies, to get a clear picture of what issues exist concerning the Title VI complaint filed by the Brandywine community and how state agencies are working to resolve the issue.

Rebecca had concerns about bringing state agencies together without including the Attorney General in the discussion without breaking any laws etc. Steve Levitsky agreed with Rebecca on this issue.

Because the Public Service Commission doesn't have anyone on the CEJSC commission Vernice thought that it would be beneficial to hear from them and get a feel for their thoughts on the issue. Rebecca also thought it would really important to hear from PSC. Vernice and Duane will work together to try to set up a meeting with PSC for November or December.

## **Baltimore City**

Rebecca provided the Commission with a case study she wrote up including five tangibles. Rebecca said the main goal is to write about the work that is already being down and use it as a platform to recommend other government entities pick up some work. The benefit of doing a case study is to elevate other folks' work.

Vernice said that as a result of CEJSC's annual report, maybe a paragraph or two should be included in the report discussing the case studies.

## **Eastern Shore**

Steve shared a dissertation by Christine D. Miller that focused on things such as: Climate Resiliency, Sea Level Rise and Environmental Justice. Steve suggested that the Commission look into what was done in the thesis and take it to the next level and to do more studies to verify what communities are being impacted and then take this information to the governor's office for more discussions.

Steve suggested bringing in Ms. Miller to discuss her dissertation with the

Commission.

## **Maryland Climate Change Update**

MCC has asked CEJSC for recommendations for outreach locations by November 15, 2016.

Vernice said we should include in the CEJSC annual report the dialogue with MCC and the ongoing desire to help influence MCC's conversation around outreach and being a partner with them.

Rebecca will take the lead on formulating the letter of recommendations

to MCC.

## **Public Comments**

Dawn from PG County expressed concerns about the industrial operators who have created these high mounds on their properties, which could be mounds of gravel or soil. She said she's been looking for some sort of guidance or action that maybe have taken place in the past relating to these stockpiles. She asked CEJSC for any suggestions on this issue. Rebecca recommended delegate Tony Knocks, who may be able to help with the situation. Rebecca also said that MACo may be of assistance with the issue. Vernice suggested Association of File Base Management Organization (AFWMO), EPA and Waste Management out of DC.

Next Meeting November 15, 2016

## Maryland Commission on Environmental Justice & Sustainable Communities (CEJSC) November 15, 2016 9:30 am-11:30 am Maryland Department of the Environment Aeris Conference Room 1800 Washington Blvd Baltimore, MD 21230

## **Meeting Minutes**

## In Attendance

- Commissioners: Duane Johnson, Vernice Miller-Travis, Rebecca Rehr, Subha Chandar, Clarence Lam, Steve Levitsky, Lesliam Quiros-Alcala
- Kamita Gray

## **Introduction**

Vernice Miller-Travis asked everyone in the meeting to introduce

## themselves. Meeting with MDE Secretary Ben Grumbles Update

Vernice said she and Andrew Fellows met with the Secretary to talk about CEJSC and it's important to the administration.

Vernice said she was encouraged to hear the Secretary say that in terms of environmental initiatives already started in Maryland, nothing will change. The Secretary said he thought CEJSC plays a very important role.

Vernice addressed the Commission membership and particularly the vacancy of the chairperson of the Commission with the Secretary. She suggested involving CEJSC in selecting the next chairperson of the Commission.

Secretary said he looks forward to continued engagement with CEJSC and will try to make additional meetings.

#### Chesapeake Bay Program Diversity Workgroup Meeting Update

Several Commissioners that attended the meeting and gave a brief update on what they thought about the meeting. Rebecca Rehr gave a brief synoposis of what the Cheasapeake Bay Program does.

Rebecca said the Diversity Workgroup is looking at what their workforce looks like and what their workforce is doing. There were breakout sessions to discuss long and short term goals of the workgroup.

## Maryland Climate Change Commission

The Climate Commission has asked CEJSC to make written recommendations as to where to do outreach as it pertains to the Greenhouse Gas Reduction Act in underserved communities.

Rebecca Rehr talked about the draft letter she completed for the Climate Change Commission. She said that the letter won't go in the Climate Change Commission final report but will be on their website. The fact that the letter won't go into their Annual Report was based on timing of the request from the Climate Change Commission.

Vernice said CEJSC wants to help recommend two communities for outreach. CEJSC will need someone to be involved in the Climate Change working group to help them be as successful as possible with the outreach initiative.

Rebecca said as the Education, Communication and Outreach (ECO) working group moves forward, CEJSC should make a formal request to ECO keep CEJSC in the loop of things.

## Community Outreach Update

- **Eastern Shore:** Steve Levitsky said he did some additional research on the climate change issue and found a dissertation done by a PH student from UMD that spoke about some issues in lower Somerset County. Steve said he wants to get the student attend the next CEJSC meeting to talk about her findings.
- **Brandywine:** Vernice said one of the problems in Brandywine is the lack of communication between the PSC and State agencies. Vernice said EPA is looking at an Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) process to try to resolve the complaint issues in Brandywine.
- **Baltimore City:** Rebecca said she went to a meeting at the Office of Sustainability for Baltimore City to get input on their plans. Rebecca said she thinks they are beginning to get outreach directly from a government entity. She said she will write up a report to be used for a government model for future government led community outreach.

#### **Public Comments**

Kamita Gray asked that CEJSC not white wash the EJ issues and cumulative impact in Prince George County with a 68% African American population. She would like CEJSC to take a broader look at what is happening across the county in respect to permitting, facility operations and disproportionate impact on underserved communities

#### **Meet Adjourned**

#### Commission on Environmental Justice and Sustainable Communities 9:30 a.m-11:30 am Tuesday, January 24, 2017 11 Bladden Street Annapolis, Maryland

#### **Meeting Minutes**

#### In Attendance

- Commissioners: Duane Johnson, Mike Pedone, Steve Levitsky, Janet Moye Cornick, Dick Fairbanks(Phone), Larry Brown(Phone), Rebecca Rehr
- Participants: Vernice Miller-Travis, Angelo Bianca, Theresa Tassey, Grace McClain, Richard Allen, Andrew Fellows, Tamara Toles O'layhl, Stephanie Cobb Williams (Phone), Jeaneen Maxwell (Phone), Doreen Paster, Gwen DuBois

#### **Introductions**

Vernice Miller-Travis started the meeting by welcoming everybody and inviting everyone to introduce themselves. All persons in attendance introduced themselves along with their positions.

Secretary Ben Grumbles talked about a few initiatives/priorities that MDE will be working on for 2017

- Consistent engagement and support for the Commission.
- Working on a policy in reference to Title VI for departments at MDE.
- Finalize the Consent Decree with Baltimore City.
- Continue to reduce lead exposure in Maryland.
- Provide more assistant in making citizens aware of the dangers of Radon in the State of Maryland.

#### **Update on New Members**

Duane Johnson gave an update on the Commissions new membership indicating that at this point the Commission is fully staffed. Duane said that he will be emailing the updated membership to everyone.

#### Update on the Partnership with the Climate Commission

Rebecca Rehr said discussion on Environmental Justice is scheduled for March 16<sup>th</sup> at 10:00 am. The discussion on March 16<sup>th</sup> will be around defining EJ communities and agreeing on communities to do outreach.

Vernice recommended that Duane send out a calendar invite for the March 16<sup>th</sup> to the Commissioners.

#### Environmental Justice: Food Deserts & Equity

Rebecca said the Environmental Justice legislative team and the Environmental Health Network have decided to focus on food desert legislation and lead blood level legislation.

Rebecca said they are working on relationship building with the Black Caucus and they are hosting a luncheon on March 1<sup>st</sup> from 11:30 am to 1:00 pm. Rebecca said the Black Caucus is very interested in food deserts.

Rebecca proposed that the Commission change their February meeting to a conference call to allow more people to attend the March 1<sup>st</sup> luncheon. A vote was taken and it was voted to have the February meeting as a conference call.

Angelo Bianca shared his concerns about the February meeting being a conference call and how that may affect the introductions of the new Commissioners.

The Commissioners suggested that the new Commissioners arrive to the luncheon an hour earlier.

Rebecca said in the past the Commission weighed in on certain EJ legislation and was wondering if the Commission wanted to weigh in on any issues that may have EJ implications.

#### Annual Report Update

Vernice said that Duane has done his portion of the report and she will edit the minutes that she has and get them to Duane so that the report can be finalized.

#### **Updates on Work Plan Studies**

- Baltimore City
  - Rebecca said the case study is with the Office of Planning and The Office of Sustainability which meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> Tuesday of the month which she will begin to attend.
  - Rebecca said the case study that will be written up will most likely be the methodology and success stories of the Office of Planning and the Office of Sustainability. It is suggested that we include it in CEJSC report next year.

#### • Eastern Shore

- Steve Levitsky said he tried to contact Dr. Miller on the Eastern Shore but was unsuccessful. He will try to get her to the next CEJSC meeting.
- Steve is working on getting some video done on communities of interest on the Eastern Shore.
- Brandywine
  - Vernice is suggesting that Brandywine stakeholders come together and present what's going on in Brandywine and where they are in resolving those concerns at the March meeting.

Vernice said she will send Duane the article concerning EPA Environmental Compliance within Title VI and he will send it to the Commission.

Vernice asked Stephanie Cobb Williams to structure how the Commission should have the conversation with the community of Brandywine concerning the Title VI complaint.

#### Plan for Commission for 2017

• Increasing the Commission engagement with the Legislators.

- Work hand in hand with the Maryland Department of the Environment.
- Continue to work with MDE on getting a Chair for the Commission.
- Continue to partnerships with other State agencies and Baltimore City.
- Continue to complete tasks as outlined in previous minutes.
- Continue conversation with Maryland Association of County Officials (MACo) and Maryland Municipal League (MML).

#### **Public Comments**

Tamara Toles of the Maryland Environmental Health Network said CEJSC should think broadly about how outreach happens.

Ms. Toles said the Metropolitan Council of Governments is about to release an environmental tool kit that is for all of the jurisdictions so there won't be a need to start from scratch when there is something targeted to elected officials.

#### **Meeting Adjourned**

#### Commission on Environmental Justice & Sustainable Communities (CEJSC) Conference Call Meeting Minutes 9:30 am – 11:30 am Tuesday, February 28, 2017

#### Attendance

- Commissioners: Rebecca Rehr, Subha Chandar, J Moye Cornick, Camille Burke, Steve Levitsky, Tanvi Gadhia, Crystal Faison, Deriece Pate Bennett, Duane Johnson.
- Participants: Andrew Fellows, Stephanie Cobb Williams, Jeaneen Logan, Tab Aburn, Laura Rogers.

#### **Introduction**

Duane Johnson asked everyone to introduce themselves. New Commissioners were asked to take a few extra moments to say something about themselves.

#### **Approval of Minutes**

The following 2016 minutes were approved: July, August, September, October and November.

#### Update on CEJSC Chairperson Vacancy

Duane announced that the commission now has a new Chairperson. Her name is Camille Burke. She is from the Baltimore City Health Department.

#### **New Commissioners Orientation Discussion**

This discussion was basically tabled until another time but there were some suggestions to include some specific items in a New Commissioner's orientation package. These items are: 1) 2015 and 2016 Maryland Climate Change Commission Annual Reports and 2) Environmental Justice 101 documents.

Rebecca Rehr indicated that she would like to know what the new Commissioners might be interested in doing over the next two years as it relates to CEJSC. Are the new commissioners looking to get something specific out of the commission or are they looking to contribute something specific to the commission? How do the new commissioners see their careers adding to the work of the commission, Rebecca asked? It was suggested that Camille, Rebecca and Duane talk offline about how best to set up an orientation forum for the new Commissioners.

#### Maryland Black Legislative Caucus Luncheon Update

Rebecca gave an update for the event scheduled on March 16, indicating that one of the reasons this luncheon is taking place is to build a relationship between CEJSC and the Legislative Black Caucus. Rebecca said the discussion will be centered around Food Deserts and Equity. Rebecca said it will be a broad range of people attending from academia, ministers to advocacy people.

Camille indicated that she will be attending and that she will be bringing a Baltimore City Food Desert expert.

#### Mitigation Working Group (MWG) Meeting Update

Rebecca briefly explained what it is that the Maryland Climate Change Commission (MCCC) is tasked to do. One of those tasks is to do outreach to underserved communities. Rebecca said the meeting on March 16<sup>th</sup> will focus on EJ and underserved communities and that the MWG invited CEJSC to speak on the panel. Rebecca suggested that maybe this would be a good time to determine which member of the CEJSC commission would be a good choice to participate on the panel. Duane suggested Rebecca. After hearing Tanvi Gadhia speak, Rebecca suggested using Tanvi or someone she knows.

Tad Aburn, the Director of the Air and Radiation Management Adminstration for the Maryland Department of Education (MDE), said the MCCC is most interested in the best way to reach out to underserved communities. "How do we make the policy work for everybody?" asked Tad. Tad said this is a great opportunity to let the MCCC and the MWG know what CEJSC thinks about the outreach initiative. It is also a golden opportunity to work with MCCC to engage with certain other communities.

Subha Chandar asked if this initiative is centered more around mitigation, the larger contexts of adaptation strategies, the other outreach or is the MWG only focused on the mitigation Green House Gas with the CEJSC partnership?

Tad answered and said the March meeting will be focused on the mitigation side but they are also partnering with another working group called the Adaptation and Resiliency Working Group.

Rebecca asked Tad if he would consider asking someone from the community to come to the March 16 meeting. Tad said he would look into that. Tad also suggested having someone from CEJSC speak about how the commission is regrouping and excited about partnering with the MWG.

New Commissioner Deriece Pate Bennett introduced herself and shared something about her background.

#### Public Comments

None

**Meeting Adjourned** 

Next Scheduled meeting March 28, 2017

#### Commission on Environmental Justice & Sustainable Communities (CEJSC) Montgomery Park, Baltimore, MD Aeris Conference Room April 25<sup>th</sup> 2017

#### **Meeting Minutes**

#### In Attendance

- Commissioners: Duane Johnson, Robert Hackman (phone), Crystal Faison (phone) Delegate Clarence Lam (phone) Rebecca Rehr, Malachy Rice, Camille Burke, Steve Levitsky, Tanvi Gadia, Joe Griffiths
- Participants: Tad Aburn (phone), Liz Entwisle, Hope Hurley, Brian Hug Introductions

Camille Burke asked everyone to introduce themselves. March meeting minutes were approved. July Retreat Updates

Camille mentioned that Reggie Harris, EJ Coordinator from EPA Region 3, tentatively agreed to participate at the July retreat.

Camille said that several venues are under consideration for the retreat and they appear to be a little pricey. For example, Volmer Center at Cylburn fee is \$225 per hour and the Wiley H. Bates Legacy Center is between \$200-\$300 per day. The Robinson Nature Center in Howard County is closed on Mondays and Tuesdays. Tuesday is the day the Commission meets on.

Crystal Faison indicated that she will be looking into a facility in PG County that the Commission may be able to use at no cost for the retreat.

#### Case Studies Updates

- Baltimore City: Rebecca Rehr said Baltimore City had their big Sustainability release the prior week. Rebecca said she will get back to Baltimore to get an update on how the release went and report back to the Commission.
- <u>Eastern Shore:</u> Steve Levitsky said he spent a lot of time over the last week looking into the case study as it relates to climate change, sea level rise and its impacts to impoverish and minority communities on the Eastern Shore.

Steve thinks the primary focus for the Commission should be to focus on those affected communities and to make recommendations to the Governor. Steve indicated that Talbot, Dorchester and Somerset Counties should be the main focus.

Steve said some of his next steps will be to meet with Eastern Shore Land Conservancy to see where they are with their work and he still wants to get Christine Miller to come in and talk about her PH.D study she did. Steve said he contacted the Chesapeake Conservancy to see if there is any GIS mapping that can be quickly mapped to show sea level rise model expectations, minority and poverty census overlaid to focus efforts on.

Steve said the CEO is interested in working with the Commission on nailing down where sea level rise will hit in these counties. Rebecca indicated that another resource that Steve could use could be the Department of Natural Resources which has some really good mapping sources.

Camille asked has if anyone has done any targeted outreach to the communities. Steve said Christine Miller did some for her thesis research and for the Eastern Shore Land Conservancy as well in Talbot County but none in Dorchester or Somerset Counties.

Steve gave a brief introduction on how the case studies came about. Rebecca said Baltimore City case study focused on what government is doing. Eastern Shore is a mix of academics, government and non-profit sectors. Brandywine was community base driven. The idea is to highlight work that's already being done and then make recommendations to the Governor and legislators.

Brandywine's case study will be revisited in-terms of how to move forward with it.

Liz Entwisle from MDE gave a brief presentation on the Maryland Clean Air 2017 Progress Report. She said Maryland is doing a lot to bring down air pollution from sources in the state. She says Maryland can't tackle this pollution unless we can get cooperation from other states that have power plants that are blowing their pollution down to Maryland.

Liz talked about electric vehicles. She said the state is really pushing for more electric charging stations throughout the state. Liz said in terms of people using the charging stations, trends are going upwards. Robert Hackman suggested that the Commission could make a recommendation to the Governor that all state agencies increase their use of electric vehicles.

Potential tax credits and who are eligible to receive these credits for purchasing electric vehicles was discussed. Rebecca said this is something the Commission could whey in on by submitting recommendations to the Governor.

Besides the other things already mentioned, Camille asked Liz if there is anything the Commission can do to help the Maryland Climate Change Commission. Liz said she will take that back to Tad to answer.

#### Legislative Updates

- Food Desert Bill passed designed to increase financial incentives to provide more money to food deserts throughout the state.
- Lead Bill passed designed to provide notification of lead levels to health department and families.
- RPS Bill passed Rebecca will send the link out to this bill to the Commissioners.
- Maryland Black Caucus had a successful luncheon with CEJSC.

Camille reminded Commissioners to turn in their Financial Closure Form if they haven't already done so.

#### Public Comments

• None Meeting Adjourned

Next Meeting May 23rd 1800 Washington Blvd

#### Commission on Environmental Justice & Sustainable Communities (CEJSC) Montgomery Park, Baltimore, MD Aeris Conference Room June 27, 2017

#### **Meeting Minutes**

#### In Attendance

- Commissioners: Duane Johnson, Robert Hackman, Rebecca Rehr, Dick Fairbanks, Subha Chandar, Crystal Faison, Camille Burke, Janet Moye Cornick, Clarence Lam, Joseph Griffiths
- Participants: Liz Entwisle, Jeaneen Maxwell Logan, Angelo Bianca

#### **Introduction**

Camille Burke started the meeting by welcoming everyone and asking everyone to introduce themselves.

May meeting minutes were approved.

#### **CEJSC/CEHPAC Joint Meeting Update**

Camille highlighted the four topics that were discussed: Climate Change and Children's Health, Environmental Public Health Tracking Program, Health in All Policies and the Impact Case Studies.

Rebecca indicated the Health in All Policies Commission did meet and their report is due in January 2018.

Camille said that Children's Environmental Health & Protection Advisory Council (CEHPAC) wanted CEJSC to considered partnering with them on the topics of Pesticides and Climate Change. Camille said she needed to get more details from CEHPAC before she commits CEJSC.

#### **Case Study Updates**

**Eastern Shore**: Subha Chandar indicated that DHMH has a Climate Change grant from the Center for Disease Control and Prevention and as long as they have the grant they will continue to work on the health related adaptation related climate change issues.

Subha said the Eastern Shore Land Conservatory hasn't taken on environmental justice health equity approach to community engagement and maybe CEJSC could make suggestions. She said in terms of making this a full fledge case that could be something that could talk about at the July retreat.

Rebecca Rehr talked about what is the intent of the case studies saying that they are more about showing geographical diversity so that people would understand that it's just not

Baltimore City or Prince George County. She said it's really to show what tangible examples of what is environmental justice. She people really don't have a tangible example what environmental justice is and how is Maryland already implementing the principles without naming them as environmental justice communities.

Dick Fairbanks suggested discussing Chicken Farms at the retreat. Rebecca mention the Community Healthy Air Act and suggested continue discussion about it.

**Baltimore City:** Rebecca said that the Baltimore Office of Sustainability provided a short YouTube video and an article that would be helpful in the case study. She said she having more discussions with them to get more down to specific language to provide to Planners the group she really targeting. She said goal is to have written pieces written up for the Annual Report.

Rebecca said it's worth bringing back up the EPA equitable development idea as a resource.

Robert Hackman suggested in the Annual Report to include the distinction when the outreach is done whoever is doing the outreach recognizes that there are different people to deal with, Rebecca concurred.

#### Potential Community Outreach with Education, Communication and Outreach (ECO)

Liz Entwisle from MDE gave an update on the Maryland Climate Change Commission outreach toolkit being developed and asked CEJSC to provide resources to help build it out. She said the goal is have a library of fact sheets and other resources that climate communicators can access and download from MCCC webpage and use in diverse communities, businesses and other organizations.

Liz said another piece of the puzzle is building the communicator list a list of communicators who will go out to the communities to share information on climate change or topics of their choosing.

Robert Hackman suggested getting MML and MACo on board as far as identifying communities to do outreach too.

Duane will send out the MCCC toolkit to all Commissioners.

#### Maryland Association of Counties Summer Conference

Les Knapp gave an overview of what it is that MACo does indicating that MACo is the voice of all of the 23 Counties including Baltimore City. It's a non partisan nonprofit organization who don't care what party you belong too. As a result of continue discussions and meetings with CEJSC it was determined that a more formal discussion with MACo and CEJSC would be appropriate. Les said that's how the invitation came about for some of CEJSC Commissioners to participate at MACo summer conference 2017. The goal is to talk to Planners and Administrators concerning issues of concerns of both organizations and see if it's away to work together to resolve those issues.

Les said he would like to see 2 or 3 Commissioners attend the conference and he would allow them to stay to hear other environmental sessions if needed. Rebecca Rehr said she will be attending the conference on behalf of CEJSC.

It was mentioned for those who might be attending the conference if they could set some goals beforehand and to continue discussing these goals at the July retreat.

It was some discussion about the agenda for the MACo conference, Les went through the agenda briefly. Commissioners had some dialogue about what's the best approach to engaging the audience at the EJ session. It was suggested posing a series EJ questions to the audience such as; what does EJ mean to you etc. Dick Fairbanks said this is what real outreach represents participating in something like the MACo conference.

It was suggested that CEJSC join with the MDE booth at the conference and hand out some fliers and answer some questions about EJ.

#### July Retreat Discussion

Camille said that the retreat is on July 25<sup>th</sup> at The College Park Airport 1985 Corporal Frank Scott Drive College Park, MD

Camille asked for ideas for the retreat.

- Delegate Lam volunteer to do a session on the legislative process and how the annual reports gets to the Governor. Rebecca mentioned that Common Cause might be able to help with this.
- Rebecca suggested reintroducing David Harrington to the Commission, Crystal Faison said she will reach out to David about inviting him.
- Camille said that Reggie Harris from the EPA has confirmed that he will be attending.
- Goals for 2018 were mentioned as a topic.

#### **Public Comments**

Liz from MDE talked alittle bit about the Climate Ambassador program which will train a number of people to talk about a number of climate issues. She said as a pilot they are starting with Bon Secour Community Works in Baltimore. She said they plan on this pilot to start other Climate Ambassador programs in other communities. Another initiative they are working on is the Climate Champion which reaches out to the business sector to help their companies reduce the carbon footprint of their companies operations.

## Camille asked Commissioners to complete their Financial Disclosure Form if they haven't already done so.

#### **Meeting Adjourned**

Next Meeting July 25<sup>th</sup>

#### Commission on Environmental Justice & Sustainable Communities (CEJSC) Annual Retreat The College Park Airport July 25, 2017

#### **Meeting Minutes**

#### In Attendance

- Commissioners: Ben Grumbles, Robert Hackman, Joseph Griffiths, Dick Fairbanks, Crystal Faison, Camille Burke, Clarence Lam, Subha Chandar, Rebecca Rehr, Larry Brown Jr, John Quinn, Steve Levitsky, Tanvi Gadhia
- Participants: Duane Johnson, Angelo Bianca, Allison Gost, Brian Amoretti, Maia Davis, Tamara Toles, Quinn Fowler, Reggie Harris, Daniel Isles, Kamita Gray, Nicole Carlozo

#### **Introduction**

Camille Burke started the meeting by welcoming everyone and asking everyone to introduce themselves.

Secretary Grumbles talked briefly about the role the State is playing in environmental justice, including for example, the incineration trash project, managing sustainable materials and the partnership with communities. Secretary Grumbles stressed his desire to work closely with the Commission.

Camille Burke asked if anyone had any questions for the Secretary. Dick Fairbanks asked what other states are involved in the Sustainable Materials Management Project? Secretary Grumbles said Tennessee and Ohio.

Secretary Grumbles said another initiative the Maryland Department of the Environment is working on is recovering valuable material in trash and reusing it in ways that make sense. Mr. Grumbles also said leading the way in the climate change arena and Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative (RGGI) will be a big focus for MDE.

Camille asked about water testing in schools. Secretary Grumbles said laws came out of the General Assembly that would require testing for lead contamination of water in schools.

Robert Hackman asked about Connoting Dam and sustainable materials. Secretary Grumbles said material build up behind the dam could be dredged and used for building material

Rebecca Rehr asked if there is internal training that would work on equity with MDE staff. The Secretary said yes.

#### David Harrington, President and CEO, Prince George's County Chamber of Commerce

Mr. Harrington said he is looking forward to working with Secretary Grumbles on environmental justice issues. He said environmental justice is intentional based on your zip code, but more importantly

he asked how we address these disparities. Mr. Harrington thinks the way to deal with environmental justice issues is through the lens of equity, and said having access to the best is equity to him, which speaks to access to housing, transportation, and wealth creation. Mr. Harrington thinks evening the playing field in terms of equity has to begin with looking at zoning and land use issues, and transportation.

Mr. Harrington tasked the CEJSC with looking at zoning and land use in a way that all communities are operating in a healthy way. Mr. Harrington believes that what is in one neighborhood should be in another. For example, he said landfills should be placed in underserved communities as well as well-off communities. As environmental justice relates to the business community, he thinks businesses and the environment should co-exist, especially as they relate to health issues in communities.

Joe Griffiths mentioned looking at engagement and policies first before looking at the zoning issue. Joe said that you just can't jump to zoning without first establishing a vision or a longer-lasting plan that will allow communities access to equity.

Rebecca mentioned including zoning and planning in the CEJSC Annual Report and continuing this conversation with Macon throughout the year instead of once a year.

#### Maia Davis and Tamala Toles: Environmental Toolkit

Tamara Tolles asked how the Environmental Justice Toolkit came about. The Toolkit is a guide for policymakers on incorporating social equity, cultural sensitivity, and community health considerations into air quality, climate, and energy planning. It is intended to be a resource on government measures, practices, and policies aimed at creating cooperative solutions to issues of fair and just treatment; and equitable access in the development, application, and enforcement of environmental policies. It is envisioned that the Toolkit will be used to expand the ways in which Metropolitan Washington Council of Governments (MWCOG) members can effect meaningful engagement within communities. Ms. Toles said what she is looking for from CEJSC are comments (individually and as a body) on the EJ Toolkit.

Maia Davis talked about the 9 approaches covered in the Toolkit:

- 1. Identifying Potentially Vulnerable Populations
- 2. Providing Meaningful Engagement Opportunities
- 3. Assessing Community Impacts
- 4. Developing Metrics
- 5. Providing Data, Information and Resources for Communities
- 6. Using Citizen Science
- 7. Developing Community Leadership
- 8. Supporting Economics and Workforce Development
- 9. Mainstreaming EJ into Public Planning and Programs

Camille Burke asked who uses the EJ Toolkit. Maia said it is used by local governments for working with community leaders.

Maia said she would send the links to the toolkit

Robert Hackman mentioned that he came across another toolkit put out by the Maryland Commission on Climate Change/ Education, Communication, Outreach Working Group (MCCC/ECO). He asked Maia if the Council of Governments talked to MCCC/ECO about what they had in their toolkit to make sure they were not duplicating things. Maia said she had not seen the MCCC/ECO toolkit, but they do talk to other agencies throughout the State. Allison Gost of MCCC said their toolkit is a place where people can go to look for resources. Rebecca said neither toolkit is a mandate but are complimentary to each other.

Rebecca talked about the supplements that go into the case studies and said they are very helpful when you talk about which communities are using the toolkit in local policy making. In terms of equity, Rebecca asked if it is an over simplification to say a recommendation from CEJSC might be to implement those equity areas to the rest of the State. Rebecca asked Maia if the indicators used in the toolkit were repeatable, was there a document to pick the indicators; and does it make sense to do it across other counties or the State? Maia said if you apply the same methodology Statewide it might not turn out the way you want because western Maryland is different from the Eastern Shore, and Baltimore is very different from D.C. She said you can use the same indicators but the level you set the bars at might need some tweaking to make sense Statewide.

Camille Burke asked Maia and Tamara what CEJSC can do as it relates to the EJ Toolkit. Tamara said they are just looking for a thumps up or thumps down, or if you find something missing send them a note indicating that.

Dick Fairbanks said he did not see the involvement of the business community in the Toolkit Maia said businesses were involved on the Policy Committee and gave a lot of information on the financial view of things.

Crystal Faison asked Tamara if there is anything she can do as it relates to Prince George's County investing in EJ communities, since she's working on a project with the Redevelopment Authority. Tamara said it would be great if Crystal could send them a memo on what she is doing because this is the kind of feedback they are looking for.

#### Eastern Shore Case Studies Update:

**Nicole Carlozo** of DNR gave a discussion on how to access vulnerability data on a statewide basis, and how to scale that down to the local level and underserved communities. She said there are a number of tools available to access vulnerability data like the one used to simulate sea level rise using data that allows you to see if your area might be affected.

In 2015-2016 DNR worked on a coastal assessment to look at how natural features like wetlands, dunes, forests, oyster reefs, and bay islands could help absorb entrapped water before it reaches communities. While recognizing that natural features do not completely eliminate flooding or erosion, but may reduce community impacts.

In 2015 DNR began working with the Nature Conservancy, non-profit steering committees, and State and federal partners to complete this assessment. Several questions were asked for the assessment such as: Where are the natural features along marine coastlines that reduce risks for our coastal communities? Where are the State's vulnerable coastal communities and can we identify priorities areas along the shoreline where we could invest in conservation or restoration? Where do we think these natural features could do the most good in terms of reducing erosion? Nicole said this project took about a year to complete.

For this project resilience was defined as the ability for a community to respond to, prepare for, or recover from a coastal hazard event. Two studies were used to complete the assessment: the U.S. Army Core of Engineers risk analysis for the North Atlantic coast and the Natural Capital Projects methodology. In the end the assessment developed data products that helped to identify restoration work, flood prone vulnerable communities, shorelines prone to flooding, and shorelines with the most protective coastal habitats that are buffering inland communities. So all of this data was used to identify priority areas along the shoreline were conservation already exists or where restoration can enhance the role natural habitats play in risk reduction.

Nicole talked about the community flood risk map and one of its components – the social vulnerability index, and how she defines social vulnerability. She said they looked at a number of resources that describes social vulnerability which goes back to the definition of resilience. There are several metrics that were used for social vulnerability such as: age, income, language proficiency, and population density. Unfortunately Nicole's discussion was centered on maps that were not distributed during the meeting.

Several case studies that Nicole and DNR are working on:

- Crisfield Shorelines Impacts
- Looking at access to open space and proximity to parks, income levels, percentage of children under the poverty level, the high percentage of children less than 17 years of age, and population density.

Two communities DNR will be working with in the future are: Eagle Harbor in Prince George's County which is impacted by a power plant, and Somerset County and their shoreline project.

**Brian Amoretti** is from the Eastern Shore Land Conservatory, the land trust of the Eastern Shore, whose primary responsibility is protecting habitat and agricultural land in the form of conservation easements. About 3 years ago the Conservancy began thinking about the effects of climate change and out of that the Coastal Resilience Program came about. The goal of the Program is to help communities plan for sea level rise and the effects of climate change. Brian said the Conservancy works out of 6 counties.

Three project areas the Conservatory are working on:

- 1. The way they provide community assistance in Kent County.
- 2. They wanted the counties to know what they are vulnerable to, and to see what they know about some of the hazards and risks in their county.
- **3**. The capacity building goal for the region, and training a team in this type of participatory vulnerability assessment.

The Conservatory used a method developed by Sea Grant in North and South Carolina called Vulnerability, Consequences, Adaption, Planning and Scenario (VCAPS).

The main thrust of this method is designed so that the main input into the process comes from people on the ground in local communities, using their experiences and knowledge of what is changing and what is important in their communities. By working through this process the Conservatory can better understand what they need help with, what they can take action on, and where outside resources are need to come in and help them. Throughout this process it helps to see what the challenges are and creates a 'buy-in' to the next steps.

The VCAP method started with a series of about three dozen stakeholder interviews to gather personal knowledge about the level of climate change, where stakeholders see threats hitting the ground, and where they see they might be able to take some actions. About 2/3 of the stakeholders interviewed were County staff, and the remaining 1/3 were residents, farmers, businesses, and community and other non-profits in the County.

After additional meetings with stakeholders they were able to build a "cause and effect" chain showing how more extreme precipitation events and the chain of events affect the community. From the chain of events they were able to identify places where they could intervene and where the County could take action to reduce impacts to residents, businesses and County operations. Brian said it was a pretty interdisciplinary integrative process that produced a book of knowledge, plus science and community buy-in to produce a set of about sixty-five recommendations. Importantly, forty-eight of the recommendations came from the stakeholders. At the time of this report the County was updating their Comprehensive Plan. The County Commissioners adopted the report unanimously and the Planning Commission also adopted it. It is now referenced heavily in their Comprehensive Plan Update. The County will be updating their Hazard Mitigation Plan in 2019 and a lot of these recommendations will find a pathway to implementation. Brian said he thought it was important to see how everyone came together to talk about climate change in an open and honest way.

The second area of interest Brian talked about was mainstreaming resilience into a lot of the planning processes the counties are already going through. Counties have to update their hazard mitigation plans every five years as required by FEMA for the community to be eligible for post disaster relief funding.

The final area Brian talked about was the idea of regional collaboration, which is bringing the 6 counties on the Eastern Shore together to think collectively and collaboratively about how they can respond to the hazards and threats of climate change. The Research Adaptation Partnership consists of a number of stakeholders who assist local governments in prioritizing concerning mitigation plans, but who are able to provide resources, analysis, and strategies where needed.

The regional collaboration method is looking at ways to regionally address the gaps that exist in the ability of local governments to plan for something as big as climate change, on the Eastern Shore in particular. Looking for more places where they can be efficient, where they can go out and leverage more grant funding where it can be applied to a region instead of one community; and building capacity by bringing resources from State government or the profit sector, and sharing those resources more efficiently throughout the region.

The goals of regional collaboration are: To assist members with resources to which they already have access, to be a central location for data and information for the Eastern Shore, to have the ability to get information for the region instead of each county getting information on their own, and to be a venue for educating not only other members of the Partnership, but also elected leaders and residents.

## **Environmental Protection Agency Discussion**

Reggie Harris, Environmental Justice Coordinator at the EPA gave a brief history of Environmental Justice including the definition of EJ which is the equal protection from environmental and public health hazards for all people regardless of race, income, culture and social class.

Reggie said back in 1989 EJ was tasked with looking at the community of Chester, PA, a small community with a population of 40,000 people. The folks of Chester came to EPA and said there are too many dirty facilities in the community. Everywhere you look there are dirty hazardous facilities. They wanted to know how many of these of facilities are too many, and are the facilities affecting them. Reggie said they went down and took a look, gathered data, and did modeling studies. He said they came up with a strategy to do a Superfund Risk Assessment to see if the community was exposed to significant risk. At the same time EPA legal staff was looking to see if any of the facilities were in violation of their permits. In most instances they were not. They also wanted to know if there were any environmental statues that could be used to help them get through the study and help to answer any questions that they had.

Reggie said when they looked at the data in Chester what struck him was the blood lead data. More than 60% of children had elevated blood lead levels that exceeded CDC levels at that time. Reggie said EPA saw this as an environmental crisis, something that needed immediate attention and immediate action. He said they collaborated with the City and State, and because of the information in the report and the date collected they were given 2.5 million dollars from CDC to address childhood lead poisoning. Reggie said what was important was that community members became pro-active with City and State health departments to address childhood lead poisoning in the community.

Reggie talked about another issue in Chester, breast cancer and what he noticed was a high mortality rate. This speaks to another condition of concern, access to health care. He said women in Chester get breast cancer at a lower incidence rate but die from this disease at a higher mortality rate.

Reggie said they were looking at a community in crisis, a community where a number of conditions were occurring that were impacting the health and wellbeing of its citizens; and they opened up to taking a look at all the information and looking at the study. He said his message to CEJSC is that when they started looking at EJ and started to understand what was going on, the numbers spoke for themselves.

As a result of EPA involvement the Chester community started a group called The Chester Environmental Partnership which addresses asthma and childhood lead poisoning, and has a good working relationship with large businesses in the area. They also work hand-in-hand with a large energy plant and sit on their advisory panel.

Daniel Isles asked about the number of air permits in the County. Reggie said there were 11, of which 9 were in Chester County and contributing 99% of the emissions in that County.

Robert Hackman asked if the lead the children acquired was air borne, water borne, or paint based. Reggie said lead paint based, where houses were pre-1950 construction.

Angelo Bianca asked if the study cost anything. Reggie said yes and that the funds came from the regional administration fund, but most of the data came from in-house.

Daniel Isles, staff attorney for the EPA said one of the reasons he asked Reggie about the permits was because during the time of the study there was a legal challenge to the Pennsylvania Department of Planning brought under Title IV of the Civil Rights Act, for issuing a permit to one of the facilities in Chester. Title IV guarantees that "No person in the United States shall, on the ground of race, color, or national origin, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance."

Daniel said there are two ways to bring a case. One, you can go in with your lawyer and show the permit is discriminatory because it is the 8<sup>th</sup> permit allowed to go forward in Chester, or two, you can go the Administration route and write a letter to the EPA Office of Civil Rights and they will investigate it. The remedy in the end is that EPA could withdraw the funds.

Daniel wanted to give this backdrop on Title IV because it is important to another case which took place in the late 90's in Camden, NJ. It was a proposal to put in a cement plant where the population was 90 percent minority. The facts for this case are that the company was leasing space from the State paying \$1.00 per year for rent and paying no income tax. The good news was the plant created 15 jobs, 7 of which went to the community. The bad news was the constant truck traffic (70,000 trucks) going through the community. So the question as it relates to Title IV is what do you consider, or what wasn't considered? What was not considered was the impact of mobile sources on a community that was already suffering serious impacts from other sources of pollution. The judge said that NJDEP had a

2.5 particulate matter limit which NJ should have considered for this facility. Because of these factors the judge granted an injunction against the facility for a week, but it was eventually thrown out of court because it was not proved that intentional discrimination existed.

Daniel said if you want anything on Title IV, his office can provide it to the Commission.

Angelo Bianca asked as a result of the law suit did anything change in the community. Daniel said yes an enforcement initiative and air toxics study were done.

#### <u>Delegate Clarence Lam gave a brief introduction of the legislative process as it relates to bills being</u> <u>introduced and passed</u>

- Bills can be introduced in the House or Senate
- Find a sponsor to introduce a Bill
- 6 committees in House
- Maryland goes through 3 readings for a Bill
- People can testify on a Bill
- Sub Committees serve as another means to reach out to legislators
- Full Committee can except or reject the Sub Committee's recommendation
- Amendments are taken up during 3<sup>rd</sup> readings
- Bills that pass in the House crossover to the Senate for passage
- If a Bill doesn't pass in the 90 day session it "dies" and the process starts over again in January
- Committee Chairs have jurisdiction and can stop a Bill from coming out of committee

• If a Bill does not pass the House and Senate, it does not go to the Governor for signing

#### Rebecca Rehr gave an update on Baltimore City case study:

- What is the role of the Baltimore City case study and how will it be written up? Rebecca said the case studies are to show examples of environmental justice throughout the State.
- How do Baltimore City casework on equity and the Sustainability Plan translate to rural communities? Rebecca said she thought that a lot and thinks that is going to be an important part of how we frame the case and we write it up. She said she didn't think the goal of the case study was to also write how rural/suburban communities might do a sustainability plan; but what are the core pieces of the equity work in the Baltimore plan that are replicable that should be considered and used based on the discretion of the local jurisdiction.
- Rebecca said she does think we should provide resources that are already available.
- The idea is that we present an urban case study but realize it might not immediately translate to rural communities, but here are the core pieces.
- Baltimore City case was focused on the equity lens doing both internal analysis for their staff processes, and training internally translated and multiplied in the work that people then did.
- The other piece is the discussion with MACo concerning creating equitable healthy and sustainable community strategies for advancing smart growth and equitable development. The issue with MACo is to ask how we can e recommend that local municipalities pick toolkits and use them in their land use and zoning. Rebecca said finally they are going to answer this by relationship building with Macon at the conference.
- As it relates to questions of how is this applicable for rural and suburban communities, Rebecca said they will point out the pieces of core value.
- The point of the case is not to recommend but offer the core pieces of the equity lens.
- Part B of this could be at MACo finding who is doing related work in rural communities, who can help us with the rural case for next year. Who wants to get involved and help think about how environmental justice looks across the State in different jurisdictions, and how to include multiple sectors and multiple perspectives in the conversation.
- Equity can be part of the Planning Department but other departments as well.

## CEJSC 2018 Goals

- Identify students/interns to research possible new case studies or continue current case studies.
- Identify equity areas for State of Maryland
- Find out the status of cumulative impact info/group (MDE)
- Obtain local input for Brandywine case study
- Continue engagement with MML
- Meeting with the Governor's Office
- Set potential legislative priorities (equity in process).
- Find out what happens after Annual Report is submitted to the Governor's Office.

- Provide EJ info/issues for legislators
- Continue dialogue with MACo
- CEJSC partnering with Legislative Black Causes at luncheon

#### **Public Comments**

Kamita Gray president of Brandywine TB Southern Region Neighborhood Coalition, currently the complainants on the Title IV Complaint with the State of Maryland, asked for the support of the Commission in helping to resolve some of the issues. She expressed concern about some of the language as it related to agenda item terms, and asked that her community be part of the process at the beginning, and that people don't speak for the community.

#### **Meeting Adjourned**

#### Maryland Commission on Environmental Justice & Sustainable Communities (CEJSC) November 28, 2017 9:30 am-11:30 am Maryland Department of the Environment Aqua Conference Room 1800 Washington Blvd Baltimore, MD 21230

#### **Meeting Minutes**

#### In Attendance

- Commissioners: Duane Johnson, Stephan Levitsky, Rebecca Rehr, Subha Chandar, Tanvi Gadhia, Clarence Lam, Robert Hackman, Janet Moye Cornick, Crystal Faison
- Participants: George Aburn, Angelo Bianca, Horacio Tablada

#### **Introduction**

Camille Burke asked everyone in the meeting and on the phone to introduce themselves.

Horacio Tablada, Deputy Secretary of the Environment introduced himself and gave a brief history of his involvement in Environmental Justice issues at MDE.

October meeting minutes were approved.

Daniel Engelberg from the National Center for Smart Growth gave an overview of EJ Mapping Tools for Maryland based on established tools such as EPA EJ Screen (<u>http://ejscreen.epa.gov/mapper/</u>) and CalEnviroScreen (<u>https://oehha.ca.gov/calenviroscreen/report/calenviroscreen-30</u>):

• He talked about the different pollution burdens, environmental effects and exposures, population characteristics, and socio-economic characteristics; and discussed the following methodology for a scoring system borrowed from CalEnviroScreen:

Pollution Burden (average of exposure and environmental effects) X Pollution Characteristics (average of sensitive populations and socio-economic factors)=CalEnviroScreen model

• Mr. Engelberg mentioned collaborators such as Dr. Wilson and Dr. Payne from UMD, Prince George's County, and Bladensburg community; and shared some additional partnerships with CEJSC: Town Creek Foundation, National Center for Smart Research & Education, and the Maryland Environmental Health Network.

Rebecca said the mapping tool can be used as a tool, but not to infer causation or to define policy recommendations that provide data on a geographical scale, and in-terms of defining areas, this is where the Commission can come in and talk about:

- How we define vulnerability in the context of the Climate Commission, What indicators we use to look at EJ communities.
- If you are living in an EJ community, what does that mean to you?

- There was some talk about Action vs Data as it relates to the mapping tool. It was asked if EJScreen gives similar results and Mr. Engelberg said relatively yes, as it relates to layers.
- A survey was sent to CEJSC to gauge what the Commission thinks about this tool. A think will sent be sent that the Commission can use for the survey.
- Mr. Engelberg said he would send out the user guide for the mapping tool.
- Tanvia Gadhia asked whether transportation layers are included in the mapping tool. Mr. Engelberg said there are some.

Camille Burke tabled the topic of Defining Equity, but said she would begin to look into it and share what she found with the Commission.

Camille asked Rebecca to, be the Commission's legislative person and keep the Commission on point with what's going on in Annapolis.

#### Maryland Climate Change Commission Update

George Aburn gave a brief overview of the inception of the Climate Change Commission:

- The Commission was started in 2007.
- It developed its first climate action plan in 2008, leading to law in 2009.
- The Commission was put into law in 2015.
- It has four working groups- Adaptation, Scientific and Technical, Mitigation and Education, and Communication.
- Mr. Aburn said the Commission does a lot with green gas reduction and community outreach.
- Steve Levitsky asked Mr. Aburn if the reduction scope is 1,2 or point source. Mr. Aburn said its economy wide.
- Mr. Aburn said the Commission began a concerted effort to go into communities in 2016 to hear what they wanted to talk about. Since 2016 they have been to about to about 15 communities.
- Examples of partnerships created as a results of these outreach efforts includes: Bon Secour Hospital and Safe Alternative in West Baltimore.
- Mr. Aburn talked about the VW settlement which totals about \$76 million the State can use to help the movement and clean up the air. He said one part of the settlement requires it to have an environmental impact on EJ communities.
- Mr. Aburn asked the EJ Commission to let him know of areas where CEJSC thinks the Climate Change Commission should go.
- Someone asked Mr. Aburn what topics communities ask him to talk about. He said air pollution and that some communities say they can't find resources concerning State accentives. Mr. Aburn said they are working on facts sheets that will help address these concerns.

It was decided not to have the December meeting but to communicate by email if needed. No Public Comments

Meeting Adjourned