

# Maryland Commission on Climate Change

## Mitigation Working Group

April 5, 2018 10:00AM - 12:00PM

### Minutes

*Attendance:* Ben Grumbles, Michael Powell, Stuart Clarke, Brian Hug (for Tad Aburn), Dan Engelberg (for Gerrit Knaap), Arjun Makhijani, Joe Uehlein, Lauren Barchi (for Anya Schoolman), Tamara Toles O'Laughlin, Mike Remsberg, Tom Ballentine, Colleen Turner, Chris Rice, Elliott Campbell (for Christine Conn), Susan Payne, Tom Walz, Tyler Butler (MEA, presenter), Mike Siers (RESI Towson, presenter), Suseel Indrakanti (MDOT), Drew Veysey (Georgetown Climate Center), Gary Greening (Michael Baker/MDOT), Jim Frazier (Michael Baker), John Kumm (ECO Liaison), Catherine Menking (RESI Towson), Ken Choi (MDP), Bihui Xu (MDP), David Costello (IEER), Larry Liebesman (Climate XChange/CCL), Cheryl Arney (Climate XChange/CCL), Gerald Jackson (AFL/CIO), Jette Findsen (ABT Associates), Dorothy Morrison (MDOT), Luke Wisniewski (MDE), Lisa Nissley (MDE), Chris Hoagland (MDE), Jess Herpel (MDE), Hannah Brubach (MDE), Erick Thunell (MDE), Chris Beck (MDE), and Megan Ulrich (MDE).

*On the Phone:* Jana Davis, Drew Cobbs, Les Knapp, Lisa McNeilly, Mark Kresowik (Sierra Club), John Mosheim (GHG Engineering)

**10:05AM** Brian called the meeting to order

#### **1. Introductions**

- Introductions were made around the room and on the phone.
- Mike Powell reminded the group that the economic modeling is an important component of the planning since we must demonstrate a net positive economic impact.
- Stuart encouraged the working group to keep in mind the recommendations they made for the 2017 Commission Report, and see if/how these are being implemented in regards to the 40 by 30 Plan, or if not, how can they be incorporated.
- Secretary Grumbles arrived later and made several introductory announcements:
  - The Governor signed the RGGI extension act, as a positive statement touting the work of the State, MDE and the PSC on strengthening and extending RGGI.
  - There was a recent [press release](#) stating Maryland's strong opposition to weakening clean car rules and standards; the State and MDE wrote to Scott Pruitt opposing these efforts.
  - Reminder about the June Ozone Transport Commission meeting in Baltimore.

#### **2. Economic Modeling for the 40 by 30 Plan**

- Chris Hoagland introduced Mike Siers (RESI) and the modeling
- Presentation by Mike Siers is available on the Commission website under MWG meeting materials. He clarified several things after questions from the MWG members:
  - The REMI results will include information on the quality of jobs, which will be part of the broader equity analysis.
  - RESI likely will not be looking at stand-alone programs moving forward, but will instead focus on policy sets, in order to keep costs down by reducing the total number of scenarios, and to better capture the interactions among programs.
  - Because of the confounding variables, it is difficult to tease out the employment impact of existing programs when you look backwards, so the results of the earlier retrospective analysis are best interpreted in terms of overall trends.
  - Looking in aggregate at the good history of the REMI model's ability to make accurate predictions, they have confidence in the results of the runs upcoming for the 40 by 30 Plan modeling.
  - RESI will run sensitivity analyses for all sets of policy analyses.

- The REMI results will not feed back into the Pathways model. California is trying this now and we are waiting on the results of their study to determine whether this is cost-effective. This would be incorporated into the 2019 modeling for the final Plan, if it proves worthwhile.
- The agricultural jobs numbers are included but there are some challenges with this sector because of under-reporting in the Federal datasets that feed into the economic modeling, though these have been accounted for as well as possible.
- MDE will not use full dispersion and atmospheric chemistry modeling to evaluate the public health impacts of co-pollutant reductions, since this takes a long time, but will estimate those impacts using the EPA COBRA model. Depending on the scope of the scenarios remaining in 2019 this is something we would consider then. Cobra does go down to the county level.
- Forestry and all other industries in Maryland are included in the jobs analysis. REMI gets down to a very specific level, even crop type.
- Several additional comments/suggestions were provided by MWG members:
  - We should make sure we are able to gain information about organized labor from the results
  - It was also noted that it would be good to know about sea-level rise, real estate cost, and population density changes; however there is a problem with timing and assigning these impacts to MD actions or lack-there-of.
  - It would also be useful to be able to break information down into impacts on race, by location, and urban/rural, as part of the equity analysis.
  - It would be useful for the MWG to weigh in on what the scenarios being tested are (MDE will likely present results from a few scenarios and then discuss what else we want to do moving forward)

### **3. Brief Summary of the PACE and QECB Sub-Groups' 2017 Activities**

- Tyler Butler gave a brief update, advising that the group worked hard to develop a process for QECB, focusing most of their time on that since it was most time sensitive, and due to Federal actions is off the table for now. At this point, they are simply monitoring any changes there. They will rededicate time to Commercial PACE upcoming.

### **4. Transportation Sector Modeling Update**

- Presentation by Colleen is available on the Commission website under MWG meeting materials. She clarified several things after questions from the MWG members:
  - There has not been discussion regarding a potential ban on petroleum vehicles by a particular date, in terms of modeling for 2030.
  - MDP and MDOT will be working with MDE to provide inputs related to transportation planning and land-use decisions.
  - Any suggestions for policy bundles should be sent to MDE, MDOT or both as soon as possible.

### **5. New Business**

- May's meeting (GHG Emission Reductions from Natural Gas Fuel Conversion)
- There was no additional business presented by MWG members.

### **6. Public Comment**

- There were no public comments during this period

**12:06PM** Meeting was adjourned